Collaborative Modeling Efforts Between the U.S. and Mexican Governments

Comments by an interested spectator
James Rude

May 23, 2008
Why build the model in the first place?

- Who are your clients?
  - Intergovernmental cooperation to foster mutual capacity building

- What do policy makers want?
  - Growth through non-traditional agriculture
    - biofuels (properly modeling bi-products)
    - industrialization of agriculture minimizes the role of price as an organizing activity which makes life difficult for modeler
  - Food processing and other post farm activities
    - data availability issues
  - Growth of agriculture through trade:
    - this growth is increasingly coming from two-way trade in processed non-bulk commodities
  - Aggregate measures of the welfare of the industry

- Policy Analysis
  - Brings out the unintended consequences (Mexico GTAP: wheat)
Six Issues for Constructing Relevant Policy Models

1) Defining the commodity space with heterogeneous products
   • What is the relevant market? Is it sufficient to model the existing market with a premium or do we need to model a new market (yellow corn w/ premium or white corn model)
   • Data limitations with respect to measuring the appropriate premium or with acquiring the data for the new market

2) The Role of Vertical Relationships
   • It is as important to study vertical relationships as it is to study cross commodity effects
   • A complete modeling approach such as a computable general equilibrium (CGE) accounts for supply and demand in input mkts
     • Mexico – GTAP: 17% ↑ in land values for price shock
Six Issues for Constructing Relevant Policy Models

3) Assessing Market Power
   • What is the nature of the conduct- oligopoly, oligopsony or both? Who holds the market power – processors, retailers?
   • “New-Empirical-Industrial-Organization” (NEIO) versus Structure/Conduct/Performance approach
     • Mexican tortilla market (two largest companies--GIMSA and MINSA--account for 70% and 27% of the market)

4) The Changing Nature of Government Support
   • Method of support has changed to direct payments
     • Indirect effects versus price subsidies
     • PROCAMPO direct payments (Burfisher, Robinson, Thierfelder 2000)
Six Issues for Constructing Relevant Policy Models

5) Trade Policy
   • How do you account for intra-industry trade?
   • Many policy disputes are bilateral
     • Preferential access (RTAs)
     • Applied versus bound tariffs
     • Tariff rate quotas (Mexican corn TRQ)
     • Foreign direct investment

6) Data Requirements
   • Determined by the level of disaggregation and theoretical structure of the model
   • Insufficient data to model new markets
   • Calibrated models have the advantage that they are not as data intensive, but they need up-to-date parameters
Principles for Model Development and Maintenance

(Antle, Meilke, Pope, and Vogel)

- All models should be documented, validated, and subject to peer review
- Models should meet the following performance standards:
  - models should be parsimonious
  - models should be consistent with economic theory
  - models should be validated by conducting sensitivity analysis with respect to key parameters and variables
- Different tasks will generally require different models – there is no general purpose model that will adequately meet all research needs
- All models, data and documentation should be publicly accessible to all researchers, preferably over the internet